

Leah Valentine

Supervisor: Dr. Jason James Kelly

Aug 8th 2017

Master's Essay submitted in partial fulfillment of the degree
Master of Arts in the School of Religion at Queen's University

August 2017

-To my daughters: Lucy (bringer of light) and Samantha (listen to God). Thank you for the sacrifices you've made that you have yet to comprehend.

-To those who made me afraid and thus gave me something to overcome, and to those who were—and still remain—patient in the process.

- To my supervisor and fellow “comrade” Dr. Jason James Kelly who has always pushed me to be radical, yet myself, to keep the faith when I thought I couldn't - someone who makes me proud to be an educator. Also to Dr. Ian Alexander Cuthbertson and Dr. Heather Shipley, who always made time and space for critique and critical thought, and for believing in my theological treatises even in the absence of their own theology and in the face of our post-truth, agora of modernity.

- To the One who gave me all these ideas in the first place, because He loves me.

“What does it mean that when Jesus rises, he rises with wounds?” –Shelly Rambo

Abstract

above to analyze how theology can be deployed by victims of domestic abuse to access the unrealized and potentially healing power of affect.

Part 1: Affect Theory

How does one examine so

neurobiological lens. He explains this through his experiment

and trauma, to investigate potential healing connections. Through understanding affect in its Deleuzian, phenomenological and neurobiological formations I connect the affectual ancestry of both the trauma from domestic abuse and theology.

Part 2: Trauma as Affect

Trauma cannot be signified. “Psychological trauma is an affliction of the powerless. Traumatic events overwhelm the ordinary systems of care that give people a sense of control, connection and meaning” (Herman 1992: 33). In broad terms, trauma is “the delayed manifestation of a psychic wound sustained during an experience that has happened too quickly to allow registration and processing of the event at the time of its occurrence” (Atkinson and Richardson 2013:

undistorted and—her key term—*literal* registration of the traumatic event that, dissociated from normal mental processes of cognition, cannot be known or represented but, engraved in brain and body, manifests itself belatedly in the form of traumatic nightmares and other repetitive phenomena (Caruth 6). In other words, a memory of trauma becomes present reality, in a gap of consciousness, or Massumi’s “missing half-second.” “Folk wisdom is filled with ghosts who refuse to rest in their graves until stories are told” (Herman 4). Thus a significant aspect of recovery for survivors of trauma is regaining a “voice” about their experiences, which helps to accomplish the restoration of social order.

In *Beyond the Pleasure Principle* (1920), Sigmund Freud gives us an exemplar of this enigma as he attempts to conceptualize trauma through his illustration of a train accident. His example—an accident from which a person walks away apparently unharmed, only to suffer

found in single incidents of trauma such as Freud's train accident, whereas C-PTSD is usually diagnosed in survivors of repeated trauma induced over long periods of time such as child abuse or domestic violence. As research on C

Buddhists and cloistered nuns in a state of prayer. There is brain activity in the

Part 3: Pneumatology as Affect

3.1 History of Trauma and Theology

Trauma is ubiquitous to the Gospel. The study of Christian theology, specifically pneumatology is comorbid with the study of trauma, as Christ and his witnesses were themselves traumatized individuals. It is the trauma on the cross that makes room for the coming of the affect of the Holy Spirit. Unacknowledged and unhealed, trauma often leads to further violence, either against oneself or others, and thus to more trauma (v. D. Hunsinger 2011: 9). I will suggest that with knowledgeable intervention and wise support, however, trauma may be healed via theology, and may even become “a catalyst for growth and transformation” (v. D. Hunsinger 2011: 9) i.e. post traumatic growth

Theologians have been faced with the problem of suffering under God as soon as people began to believe that God was omnipotent. Is God responsible for suffering? Does God will it? Questions about God’s will, power, and presence are all central for Christians interpreting their experiences of suffering and the suffering around them. These theological quagmires have expanded the classical questions of the theodicy. Theodicies are the theoretical practice of reconciling claims about the goodness of God with the presence of evil in the world (Rambo 2009: 238). While theodicies might provide explanations, the degree to which explanations are helpful to the healing process is unclear. In her work, “Trauma and Faith: Reading the Narrative of the Hemorrhaging Woman” (2009) contemporary trauma theologian Shelly Rambo expresses a similar sentiment: “Though there are many explanations of how a good God can be reconciled with the evil in the world, I have not found theodicies sufficient to address the realities of

trauma. This discourse, which privileges reason and totalizing explanations, seems to “miss” (or dismiss) the fractured landscape of trauma and fails to offer wisdom that can satisfy or cure” (2009: 238). The work of theologians such as Jurgen Moltmann (1920-1999), Karl Rahner (1904-1984) and his contemporary Johann Baptist Metz (1928-) were pivotal in attempting to answer such questions in light of the incomprehensible mass trauma of the Holocaust. Moltmann revolutionized Christian interpretations of the crucifixion by claiming that God did not stand outside of the event of the cross but, rather, experienced the suffering. Claiming Jesus as no less divine on the cross, Moltmann made space, a new threshold, for the liminality of suffering. Reformulating the concept of the Trinity and dismantling notions of divine impassibility, Moltmann provided a space to process the horror of the

testifies to the fact that trauma is not simply a category that can be confined to the fields of psychology and counseling; it has broadened to present profound challenges to epistemology, constructions of the self, and theological understandings of time. (Rambo 2015: 11).

Theology, having its own history birthed from the wounds of trauma has an undervalued advantage in meeting the specific healing needs of survivors of domestic violence who suffer from C-PTSD. As shown previously, secular modalities attempt to manage the symptoms of C-PTSD, claiming a cure uncertain. Judith Herman states that to begin to recuperate from trauma survivors need three things: a safe space to process, a narrative to reclaim, and healthy relationship connections. Theology, with the specific nature and function of the Trinity cannot only provide these same services, but via the affectual aspect of the trinity and the Holy Spirit, theology may be able to provide a tool that could possibly heal trauma, specifically the trauma of domestic violence.

3.2 History of Pneumatology

In this section, I introduce and explain the theological concept of pneumatology. After presenting the history and problematics of pneumatology I suggest that it is also has an affectual nature. To further this hypothesis, I investigate how pneumatology is embodied within the Christian concept of the Trinity as an affectual force through Ratzinger's (1998) investigation of St. Augustine's physiognomy (Ratzinger 326).

Pneumatology in Christian theology is the study of the Holy Spirit. The Holy Spirit is

(



overlap with affect. Mysticism historically has been seen as dangerous as it creates a liminal affectual space for an agent to surpass self and society. In regards to self-care/space, mystical experiences match the affectual dissociation of trauma to offer victims who cannot or have not yet been able to escape the c

psychological torture, sexual degradation, and sleep deprivation, which causes equally, or even more serious consequences such as C-PTSD (Tetlow 2010: 183).

Gas-lighting, as a specific example of domestic terrorism or private torture, is a subtle yet nefarious form of psychological abuse that aims to break down the mind of the victim for the ultimate goal of control [or power]:

Batterers also use variations on the psychological torture techniques that the CIA has determined to be effective, including mind games and “crazy-making”

provides evidence of this in her short fiction piece *She Unnames Them* (1985). In the text Eve becomes tired of the garden and in solidarity with the animals she unnames them, finding instead of power, connection:

None were left now to unname, and they seemed far closer to me than when their names had stood between us: so close that my fear of them and their fear of me became one. And the attraction that many of us felt was one with the fear. The hunter could not be told from the hunted. This was more or less the effect I had been after, and I could not now make an exception of myself. I went to Adam, and said, "You and your father gave me this. It's been really useful, but it doesn't exactly seem to fit." He was not paying much attention, and only said O.K. and went on with what he was doing. I said goodbye and went out. I had only just realized how hard it would have been to explain. My words now must be as slow, new, and tentative as the steps I took going down the path away from the house, between the dark-branched, tall dancers, motionless against the winter shining. (1985: 1)

Feminist and trauma theologians have provided a rich history of scriptural interpretation attempting to challenge and change the politics surrounding traumatized women via narrative. For example, Shelly Rambo's reading of the hemorrhaging woman in Mark 5:25-34 and her focused work on *Spirit and Trauma* (2012) privileges Easter Saturday, over the resurrection, the liminal over the binary, to empower C-PTSD survivors. Rambo expresses trauma as a place where "death haunts life" (Rambo 2015: 9) and life bears death within it. Trauma as affect, disrupts our sense of time, body, and word. Yet God's spirit (is present as witness to both the pull of death and the movement of life in the space of suffering. For Rambo, salvation is not a linear victorious jump over the abyss of death into life, which is problematic from a trauma perspective as it elides suffering, oppression and violence. Instead, salvation as seen from the middle is found in the presence of the love of the Holy Spirit, who remains with us in suffering. "The middle story is not a story of rising out of the depths, but a transformation of the depths themselves" (2015: 172). Rambo's work is a co-assemblage of affect and reason. It utilizes the

rational enterprise of language to usurp linear victory narratives (such as the privileging of the resurrection over the cross) whose dichotomies imprison agents into categories such as “victim” or “survivor” when in reality most perpetually living in the liminal. This is paramount in response to Herman’s second stage of therapeutic response to trauma as “the second stage of recovery has a timeless quality that is very frightening. The reconstruction of the trauma requires

future to give it coherence and the illusion of continuity. Newness occurs in the interruption of chronological linearity: past into future, future into past; always in transition in the present. (Richardson 11)

The concept of time is significant when discussing narrative in light of trauma and theology. As already stated, the memory of trauma survivors do not obey *chronos* or the logical human construct of time. Theology also refuses the linear progression of *chronos* and instead offers *kairos* (used in Ephesians 5) to describe God's timing that is not bound by past, present or future. The theologically specific *kairos* is a way to push the discourse of post traumatic growth further. Here I will present the Catholic theologian Johann Baptist Metz to elucidate and discuss the affectual power of narrative and time in the face of trauma through his theory of dangerous memories (DM). DM is a cyclical way to think about thinking and history without the limits of the logocentric analysis of viewing history in terms of its ends. It refuses to accept salvation as linear victorious jump over the abyss of death (much like Rambo's reading previous) into life which thus bypasses suffering, oppression and violence. This is precisely why memories are dangerous. Memory can politically be manipulated through narrative, whether at the individual level or systematically, but DM subverts that power by choosing to reiterate the narrative of a common history of suffering. According to Vento (2002: 8), Metz's conception of DM was born from the silence surrounding the ashes of the Holocaust within Christendom which he saw as an effect of Christianity pushing aside its Jewish origins. This Hellenized, reason-centered Christianity had cut itself from the sources of anamnestic reason, "It has become one expression of an idealistic form of reason, unburdened by fate and incapable of recollection and historical remembrance" (Habermas 2004: 48).

Anamnestic reason (AR) is a schema that respects thinking in history without resorting to rational categories that are abstract, transcendental, and therefore insulated from the disruptions

of history. AR is the “rational response to the shortcomings of reason, as an attempt to save reason” (Ostovich 2005: 32), the term anamnestic, originating from the Greek anamnesis: a recalling to mind. It challenges reason and the ideology of logos defined by the Enlightenment and the individual’s ability to make public use of reason, to instead posit suffering as the true historical universal. Jurgen Habermas in critique and gratitude of Metz steadfastness in claiming, “Jesus was not a Christian, but a Jew” (2004: 295) breaks down AR as follows:

...that a Hellenized Christianity, when rejecting its Judaic origin, has separated itself from the source of anamnestic reason and has become the expression of an erratic and idealistic reason, incapacitated for memory and historical remembrance. Understanding Christianity in an “Augustinian” fashion as a synthesis of reason and faith—reason deriving from Athens and faith from Israel—sunders in two the spirit of Christianity. Against the division of labor between philosophical reason and religious faith, Metz insists on the rational content of the tradition of Israel; he conceives of the force of historical remembrance as an element of reason: “This anamnestic reason resists forgetting, even the forgetting of the forgetting that nests in every simple

suffering, specifically survivors of domestic violence who have not escaped, who have been murdered, who have been forgotten. These are "dangerous memories" which call into question the record of the victors in history and which do not allow the stories of the victims to be silenced. According to Vento (2002: 8) such dangerous memories challenge us to eradicate present suffering, as they disclose the hope of a future without suffering.

The theology of DM frees survivors from the pressure of voice via transc

4.3 Holy Spirit as Connection: The Body of Christ

Theology is understood to be a healing discourse that seeks to transform lived realities. But the reality of trauma is such that it cannot be isolated to particular persons. When an agent is traumatized, their sense of self is fractured, rendered unstable. Familiar affective patterns are disrupted; continuity and psychic cohesion are destroyed or deeply wounded; agency is radically limited. as legal scholar Tanina Tetlow explains:

The only major distinction between domestic violence and the catalogue of torture techniques used elsewhere is that we normally associate torture with

demonstrates how sexual

Part 5: Power, Healing and the Advantage of Affect Theology

In this section I suggest that the overall insight of affect, for survivors of domestic abuse is that it is that it could be seen as an untapped form of arational power. Drawing on Michael Foucault's theory of power, I posit that he challenges the idea that power is wielded by people or groups by way of 'episodic' or 'sovereign' acts of domination or coercion, seeing it instead as dispersed and pervasive. Power is everywhere and comes from everywhere, much the same as affect. Affect theology presents the opportunity to see that there is *power* in the *space between* words, it thereby creates an unconventional discourse to our normative epistemologies.

Contemporary affect theorists like Sara Ahmed, Ben Anderson, and Lauren Berlant present us with hope for those spaces ... the potential of an "affective bloom" (Seigworth and Gregg 2002: 10). Affective "bloom-spaces" are "the necessary critical task of always moving beyond one after 'materialism'" (10) which may be useful in empowering victims of trauma. The affective qualities of this adjacent but incorporeal "bloom-space" are outlined in a variety of ways by theorists, according to Seigworth and Gregg (2002: 9):

as excess, as autonomous, as impersonal, as the ineffable, as the ongoingness of process, as pedagogico-aesthetic, as virtual, as shareable (mimetic), as sticky, as collective, as contingency, as threshold or conversion point, as immanence of potential (futura), as the open, as a vibrant incoherence that circulates about zones of cliché and convention, as a gathering place of accumulative dispositions. Each of these figurations, in its own way, names that Spinozist "not yet" of affect as its "promise."

The belief thaffehehe

somehow essentially “sutured in to progressive liberatory politics or at least the best marrow of our angels?” (Griegg and Seigworth 10). Is it a promise or a threat? (9). I suggest instead of viewing power only as *power-knowledge* bound by the realm of reason, when accessed by a theological bloom space, victims can be empowered via *power-affect* (mysticism, *communitas*) or *power-knowledge-affect* (dangerous memories).

Domestic violence, or private torture, is a form of power terrorism. Perpetrators of abuse, specifically psychological abuse use fear, intimidation, isolation, and thought control to render victims powerless. Psychological abuse is a tactic to destroy the victim’s ability to see ‘truth’ or trust themselves or the world around them leaving them in a constant state of fear and hyper-arousal. Victims of domestic violence do not have access to the privilege of cognitivism. I specifically use the term privilege because power is a privilege and in our western epistemologies, cognitivism and rationality is the modern “sword of truth.” The significance of empowerment for victims is further elucidated in

victimization of women who are criminalized for fighting back against abusers. Victims are essentially punished for their agency, and are thus categorized by the limitations of logos as either victim or criminal, or victim or survivor (Johnson 2010: 6). Women who are traumatized at the hands of power-over relationships, also then must suffer in a power-over system as there is no space for liminality in the house of court. “Domestic violence, however, remains mired in the world of fragmentation” (an affectual descriptor) when it comes to the criminal justice system (Tetlow 2016: 203).

In her work, *When Terror Strikes at Home: The Interface Between Domestic Violence and Religion*, Nancy Nason-Clark uncovers another schism between the logocentrism of our systems and the liminality of abuse. She shares that the “secular therapeutic community does not like to work with clients who are particularly religious...because they find it difficult to challenge the religious ideation that is believed by the victim or the perpetrator to give license to abuse”, because they do not have the right language (that of the spirit or the liminal) to parlay with survivors within a theological context.

I have attempted to reveal the quandary of healing aTJ ET Qq 0.24 0 0 03iry of 0 02 (of t) 0.2 (l) 0d t

Conclusion

Affect theology provides victims of domestic abuse therapeutic taxonomy that is parallel to Judith Herman's. It offers a radical safe space through mysticism; a political narrative that subsumes reason (and refuses to closet abuse throughout time); and in praxis, it offers a more robust version of community through the accountability of *communio*. It also presents the possibility of accessing an affectual bloom space via the mediation of power, through relationship with a God that chose to live with and within them, rather than a constructed power that relies on externals or even validation from others. I illustrate this nuance with a slightly adapted version of Shelly Rambo's reading of the story of the hemorrhaging woman in Mark 5. A woman who had struggled with external bleeding for 12 years, making her unclean and an outcast in her time, after hearing about Jesus, came up to him in a crowd, touching his cloak in hopes of finding external healing. Rambo posits this interaction as proof of faith as a "*witnessed movement*"

Works Cited

- Atkinson, Meera and Michael Richardson, eds. *Traumatic Affect*. Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Publishing 2013.
- Bellah, Robert Neely, and Steven M. Tipton. 2006. *The Robert Bellah Reader*. London; Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- Benedict, and Nicholas J. Healy. Joseph Ratzinger "in communion". Grand Rapids, MI: *Eerdmans Pub. Co.*, 2010. Print.
- Beste, Jennifer E. *God and the Victim: Traumatic Intrusions on Grace and Freedom*. Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2007.
- Burke, Theresa. "How Trauma Impacts the Brain" ., *Talking points from seminar for Rachel's Vineyard Ministries*, Theresa Burke, Ph.D. www.rachelsvineyard.org
- Caruth, Kathy. "Unclaimed Experience: Trauma, Narrative and History" *John Hopkins University Press: 2016*.
- Clough, Patricia T., Micheal Hardt and Jean O. Halley. *The Affective Turn: Theorizing the Social*. Duke University Press, Durham, 2007.
- Davies, Oliver. "Holy Spirit and Mediation: Towards a Transformational Pneumatology." *International Journal of Systematic Theology*, vol. 16, no. 2, 2014, pp. 159-176.
- Deacon, Roger. "An Analytics of Power Relations: Foucault on the History of Discipline." *History of the Human Sciences*, vol. 15, no. 1, 2002, pp. 89-117.
- Del Colle, Ralph. "the Holy Spirit: Presence, Power, Person." *Theological Studies*, vol. 62, no. 2, 2001, pp. 322.
- Felman, Shoshana, and Dori Laub. *Testimony: Crises of Witnessing in Literature, Psychoanalysis, and History*. Routledge, New York, 1992. HERMAN, J. L. (1998), Recovery from psychological trauma. *Psychiatry and Clinical Neurosciences*, 52: S98–S103. doi:10.1046/j.1440-1819.1998.0520s5S145.x
- Gibson, Prudence.

- Nason-Clark, Nancy. "When Terror Strikes at Home: The Interface between Religion and Domestic Violence." *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*, vol. 43, no. 3, 2004, pp. 303-310, doi:10.1111/j.1468-5906.2004.00236.x
- National Center for PTSD. *Complex PTSD - PTSD: National Center for PTSD*. Internet: <https://www.ptsd.va.gov/professional/ptsd-overview/complex-ptsd.asp>
- Nola, Robert. "Knowledge, Discourse, Power and Genealogy in Foucault." *Critical Review of International Social and Political Philosophy*, vol. 1, no. 2, 1998, pp. 109-154
- Nouwen, Henri. *The Wounded Healer: Ministry in Contemporary Society*. Random House, New York. 1972.
- Oort, J. v. "The Holy Spirit and the Early Church: The Experience of the Spirit." *HTS Theologiese Studies/Theological Studies*, vol. 68, no. 1, 2012, pp. 1-7.
- Ostovich, Steven. 2005. Dangerous memories and reason in history. *Kronoscope* 5 (1): 41-58.
- Powercube. "Foucault: Power Is Everywhere." Internet: www.powercube.net/other-forms-of-power/foucault-power-is-everywhere/.
- Rambo, Shelly. "'Theologians Engaging Trauma' Transcript." *Theology Today*, vol. 68, no. 3, 2011, pp. 224-237.
- Rambo, Shelly. "God and the Victim: Traumatic Intrusions on Grace and Freedom - by Jennifer Erin Beste." *Modern Theology*, vol. 25, no. 3, 2009, pp. 526-528.
- Rambo, Shelly. "Spirit and Trauma." *Interpretation: A Journal of Bible and Theology*, vol. 69, no. 1, 2015, pp. 7-19.
- Rambo, Shelly. "Trauma and Faith: Reading the Narrative of the Hemorrhaging Woman." *International Journal of Practical Theology*, vol. 13, no. 2, 2009, pp. 233. Link
- Robert, Daniel A. 2013. Ricoeur, metz, and the future of dangerous memory. *Literature & Theology: An International Journal of Religion, Theory, and Culture* 27 (2): 196-207.
- Schafer, Donovan. "Religious Affects: Animality, Evolution, and Power." *Duke University Press*: London: 2015.
- Sedgwick, Eve K., and Adam Frank. "Shame in the Cybernetic Fold: Reading Silvan Tomkins." *Critical Inquiry*, vol. 21, no. 2, 1995, pp. 496-522.
- Sethanne Howard and Mark W. Crandall. "Post Traumatic Stress Disorder What Happens in the Brain?" *MD US Naval Observatory*

- Turner, Victor. "Liminal to Liminoid, in Play, Flow, and Ritual: An Essay in Comparative Symbology." *Mediações: Revista De Ciências Sociais*, vol. 17, no. 2, 2012, pp. 214-257
- van de Kolk, Bessel A. "The Psychobiology of Posttraumatic Stress Disorder." *The Journal of Clinical Psychiatry*, vol. 58 Suppl 9, 1997, pp. 16.
- van der Kolk, Bessel A. "The Drug Treatment of Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder." *Journal of Affective Disorders*, vol. 13, no. 2, 1987, pp. 203-213.
- van der Kolk, Bessel A. "The Psychobiology and Psychopharmacology of PTSD." *Human Psychopharmacology: Clinical and Experimental*, vol. 16, no. S1, 2001, pp. S49-S64.
- van der Kolk, Bessel A., "The Body Keeps the Score". New York: *Viking*, 2014.
- van der Kolk, Bessel A, et al. "Dissociation, Somatization, and Affect Dysregulation: The Complexity of Adaptation of Trauma." *American Journal of Psychiatry*, vol. 153, no. 7, 1996, pp. 83-93.
- Vento, Johann. "Violence, Trauma and Resistance a Feminist Appraisal of Metz's Mysticism of Suffering onto God"
- Woodhouse, H. F. "the Holy Spirit and Mysticism." *The Irish Theological Quarterly*, vol. 44, 1977, pp. 58.
- World Health Organization. *Violence Against Women*. 2017
<<http://www.who.int/mediacentre/factsheets/fs239/en>>