Contents

"#$%&'()$*&#+!! ,

-$$%.)$*#/+.#'+01$.*#*#/+2345&6117+!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!! ,

8&33(#*).$*&#+!! 9

:.51#$+01$1#$*&#+!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!! ;

<(3.#+017&(%)17+!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!! ==

"34%&>131#$7+$&+-))&(#$.?*5*$6+@17*/#+!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!! =,

8&#)5('*#/+%13.%A7+!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!! =B

C.%$*)*4.#$7D+!! =E

Introduction

:F1+ .?*5*$6+ &G+ $F1+ 8.#.'*.#+ 4(?5*)+ 71%>*)1+ $&+ 41%G&%3 +)&3 45*).$1'+$.7A7+ HF*51+ 3 .*#$.*#*#/+.))&(#$.?*5*$6+#&%3 7+G&%+C.%5*. 31#$+.#'+$F1+4(?5*)+*7+&#1+&G+$F1+3 .I&%+ /&>1%#.#)1+*77(17+ &G+&(%+$*3 1!+ 0171.%)F+)&#'()$1'+?6+$F1+81#$%1+G&%+$F1+J$('6+&G+ @13&)%.)6+1K45&%1'+H.67+$&+4($+.+'*GG1%1#$+G%. 31+&#+G($(%1+&G+4(?5*)+71%>*)1+&$F1%+ $F.#+$F1+&#1+$F.$L7+?11#+17$.?5*7F1'+*#+$F1+4(?5*)+)&3 31#$.%6M'*7)&(%71!

:F*7+4%&)177+*#>&5>1'+4%14.%*#/+.+71%*17+&G+H&%A*#/+4.41%7+G&%+)&3 31#$+?6+4(?5*)+ 71%>.#$7+.#'+4&5*$*).5+7)*1#$*7$7+.#'+G&%3 1%+)*>*5+71%>.#$7!+

8J@+*#>*$1'+$F1+%1.'1%7+$&+.$$1#'+.+%&(#'$.?51+$&+1K45&%1+$F1+*77(17+&G+.))&(#$.?*5*$6+ '17*/#N+41%G&%3 .#)1+*3 4%&>13 1#$7N+.#'+.$$%.)$*#/+.#'+%1$.*#*#/+O(.5*$6+13 45&6117!

H*55+71%>1+$F1+%1#1H.5+#11'7+&G+$F1+C(?5*)+J1%>*)1b

71%>.#$7+*#+8.#.'.+)&(5'+?1+71)&#'1'+$&+H&%A+*#+$F1*%+%1741)$*>1+F&31+'14.%$31#$7+
.%&(#'+$F1+H&%5'+

:F1+)5&71'+)F.%.)$1%+&G+$F1+4(?5*)+71)$&%+%1O(*%17+%1>*1H+?1).(71+*$+*7+'*GP*)(5$+$&+
1#$1%+$F1+4(?5*)+71%>*)1+.$+.+3.#./131#$+51>15+?16&#'+4&7$c71)&#'.%6+%1)%(*$31#$+
4%&/%.37!+

2345&6117+.%1+1./1%+$&+1K45&%1+P51K*?51+H&%A*#/+.%%.#/131#$7 ^ (7*#/+$1)F#&5&/6+$&+
H&%A+G%&3+F&31Q+G&%+*#7$.#)1!+ :1)F#&5&/6+)&(5'+.57&+?1+(71'+$&+*#)%1.71+4&5*)6+
7F&47+&($7*'1+&G+W$$.H.!+ :F1+?1#1P*$+H&(5'+?1+.+7$%&#/1%Q+4&7*$*>1+*3./1+&G+4(?5*)+
71%>*)1!+

<&H1>1%Q+*G+$F1+31)F.#*)7+&G+%1)%(*$31#$Q+HF*)F+H1%1+'17)%*?1'+.7+L.44.55*#/LQ+.%1+
#&$+%1>*71'Q+G%(7$%.$*&#+H*55+)&#$*#(1!+ -44.%1#$56Q+*$+$.A17+$H*)1+.7+5&#/+$&+F*%1+G&%+
$F1+Z1'1%.5+4(?5*)+71%>*)17+.7+*$+'&17+G&%+4%&>*#)*.5+)&(#$1%4.%$7!+O1)%(*$1%7+G%&3+$F1+
W#$.%*&+4(?5*)+71%>*)1+.%1+.?51+$&+&GG1%+I&?7+&#+$F1+74&$+$&+YC-+7$('1#$7+'(%*#/+
).34(7+%1)%(*$*#/+7177*&#7!+ :F1+Z1'1%.5+4%&)177+$.A17+3&#$F7+.#'+?6+$F*7+$*31+$F1+
?17$+.#'+$F1+?%*/F$17$+.%1+.5%1.'6+F*%1'!++

\1+H1%1+$&5'+$F.$+*#+$F1+5.7$+45.##1'+ag1H+ \.>1b+1K1%)*71+*#+%1)%(*$31#$+.#'+

767$1 3 7+ .#'+$*3 1Q+ $F1%1+*7+ .+%1.5+'*7)&##1)$+?1$H11#+HF.$+ 3 .#./1%7+ .#'+4&5*)6+ ?&.%'7+.%1+7.6*#/+.#'+HF.$+*7+?%*#/+*3 451 3 1#$1'!++

0&(#'$.?51+4.%$*)*4.#$7+$&5'+(7+$F.$+$F1%1+.%1+$&&+ 3 .#6+41&451+$%6*#/+$&+ 3 .A1+ '1)*7*&#7+.$+$F1+7. 3 1+$*3 1 ^ %17(5$*#/+*#+*#.)$*&#+?1).(71+aH1+'&#I$L+A#&H+HF.$+H1+ .%1+'&*#/mb

W#1+ H&#'1%7+ *G+ $F1%1+ *7+ .+)&%%15.$*&#+ ?1$H11#+)1#$%.5*k.$*&#+ .#'+ *#$1%#.5+)& 3 3 (#*).$*&#7!+ g1H1%+ .#'+ 3 &%1+I(#*&%+ 1 3 45&6117+ 5.)A+ (#'1%7$.#'*#/+ &G+ $F1+ '1)*7*&#c 3 .A*#/+4%&)177+.#'+$F1%1+*7+5*$$51+$&+#&+&44&%$(#*$6+$&+7*$+'&H#+.#'+'*7)(77+ $F171+*77(17+H*$F+ 3 .#./1%7!+ :F1%1+.%1+4%&?51 3 .$*)+*#$1%.)$*&#7+?1$H11#+$F&71+.$+ $F1+)1#$%1+ .#'+ .$+ $F1+ 41%*4F1%6+ S.#'+ *$+ H&(5'+ ?1+ *#$1%17$*#/+ $&+ 1K45&%1+ $F*7+ '*GG1%1#$*.5V!+ :F&71+.$+$F1+)1#$%1+.%1+1K)*$1'+.#'+.H.%1+&G+HF.$+*7+/&*#/+&#+HF*51+ &$F1%7+.%1+51G$+G115*#/+'*7)&##1)$1'!++

\1+.57&+F1.%'+&G+$F1+'*%1+#11'+G&%+*3 4%&>1'+)& 3 3 (#*).$*&#+?1$H11#+1K1 3 4$+7$.GG+ .#'+4(?5*)+71%>.#$7!+ g1*$F1%+ (#'1%7$.#'7+ $F1+ &$F1%L7+ %&517+ .#'+ $F1+ %17(5$+ *7+ '*>*7*>1#177Q+G%(7$%.$*&#+.#'+5.)A+&G+.)F*1>1 3 1#$!+

J$%&#/+&?I1)$*&#7+$&+$F1+$*$51+&G+a8F*1G+&G+J$.GGb+H1%1+1K4%1771'+?1).(71+*$+G.57156+ '1#&$17+1K1)($*>1+.($F&%*$6Q+.#'+%145.)1+*$+H*$F+2K1)($*>1+-77*7$.#$Q+&%+.#&$F1%+$*$51+ $F.$+.))(%.$156+%1P51)$7+$F1+#.$(%1+&G+$F1+4&7*$*&#!+-55+G15$+$F.$+4&5*$*).5+.'>*7&%7+.%1+ .77*7$.#$7+#&$+'1)*7*&#c 3 .A1%7+.#'+$F.$+ 3 .A*#/+$F*7+ 3 &%1+&?>*&(7+*7+*3 4&%$.#$!+

:F1+ F*1%.%)F*).5+ 5.61%7+ .#'+ *#)&#7*7$1#$+ 4%&)17717+ &G+ .44%&>.5+ .57&+ G%(7$%.$1+ %&(#'$.?51+4.%$*)*4.#$7!+2>1#+5&#/+$1%3 +1 3 45&6117+*#+WCJ+%1 3 .%A+$F.$+$F16+.%1+#&$+ 7(%1+HF.$+$F1*%+%&517+.#'+%174&#7*?*5*$*17+.%1!+Z&%+1K. 3 451Q+*G+&#1+'*7./%117+H*$F+ $F1*%+ 3 .#./1%+ &%+ P*#'7+ 7& 3 1$F*#/+ (#1$F*).5Q+ $F16+ 3 .6+ #&$+ %1.)$+ &%+ 0(17$*&#+ *$+ ?1).(71+$F16+.%1+(#)1%$.*#+.?&($+$F1+7(44&%$+$F16+H*55+%1)1*>1+S1741)*.556+%1/.%'*#/+ HF*7$51+?5&H*#/V!+01.)$*&#7+.#'+'1)*7*&#7+.%1+.'+F&)+.#'+$F1%1+*7+5*$$51+'*%1)$*&#+ /*>1#!+Y.#./1%7+&#56+/*>1+.7+3 ()F+*#G&% 3 .$*&#+.7+$F1*%+41%7&#.5+'*7)%1$*&#+41% 3 *$7!+ :F1%1+*7+#&+17$.?5*7F1'+45.##*#/+4%&)177+&%+71$+&G+)&%4&%.$1+>.5(17+S&%+*G+$F1%1+.%1Q+ $F16+.%1+#&$+?1*#/+*3 451 3 1#$1'V!

Y.#./1%7+.#'+'*%1)$&%7Q+HF*51+%1741)$*#/+4%&$&)&5Q+7F&(5'+5&&A+G&%+&44&%$(#*$*17+$&+ *#)5('1+.+#1H+%1)%(*$+*#$&+.+'14($6L7+?&.%'%&& 3 +&%+'*%1)$&%L7+ 3 11$*#/7Q+.7+.+H.6+$&+ ?(*5'+$%(7$+.#'+3 *$*/.$1+G1.%!++*$F&($+$F*7Q+.+%1.5*7$*)+41%)14$*&#+&G+F*/F1%+&GP*)*.57+*7+ 5.)A*#/!+-$$1#'.#)1+.$+.+3 11$*#/+H&(5'+1K4&71+I(#*&%+1 3 45&6117+$&+$F1+'1)*7*&#c 3 .A*#/+4%&)17717+.#'+%.$*&#.51+G&%+.+)&(%71+&G+.)$*&#!+"#G&% 3 .$*&#+G%& 3 +a$F1+81#$%1b+ #11'7+$&+?1+)&##1)$1'+.#'+'*771 3 *#.$1' ^ 7& 3 1$F*#/+$F.$+*7+#&$+F.441#*#/+#&H!+ d&%%&H*#/+G%& 3 +$F1+4%*>.$1+71)$&%Q+1GG&%$7+$&+?%*#/+41&451+$&/1$F1%+G%1O(1#$56+G&%+ 1#1%/6+.#'+3 &%.51+?&&7$*#/+.)$*>*$*17+7F&(5'+?1+1#)&(%./1'!+

.?51+$&+$.A1+.+51.>1+&G+.?71#)1+G&%+&#1+&%+$H&+61.%7+&#+%1.7&#.?51+/%&(#'7+HF*)F+H&(5'+/(.%.#$11+$F13+&#+$F1*%+%1c1#$%6+#&+5&77+&G+71#*&%*$6+&%+71)(%*$6!+

-+G&%3.5*k1'+31#$&%7F*4+4%&/%.3+H.7+7(//17$1'+.7+.+31.#7+$&+.77*7$+.+#1H+%1)%(*$L7+*#$1/%.$*&#+*#$&+$F1+4(?5*)+71%>*)1+.#'+$&+*#G&%3+).%11%+4.$F+)F&*)17!+-#+WCJ+31#$&%7F*4+4%&/%.3+*7+.44.%1#$56+?1*#/+5.(#)F1'Q+.5$F&(/F+5*$$51+*#G&%3.$*&#+.?&($+*$+*7+G&%$F)&3*#/!+"$+H.7+G15$+$F.$+$F*7+1GG&%$+H&(5'+$FH.%$+$F1+1K&'(7+&G+6&(#/+41&451+51.>*#/+'(1+$&+G%(7$%.$*&#+H*$F+$F1*%+*#.?*5*$6+$&+#(%$(%1+)&#$.)$7+.#'+'1>15&4+1K41%$*71!+

"#+)&#$%.7$Q+%1G1%%*#/+$&+$F13715>17+.7+a-2C1%7bQ+-))151%.$1'+2)&#&3*7$7+C%&/%.3+%1)%(*$7+'17)%*?1'+.+7$%&#/+71#71+&G+.GP*#*$6+$&+$F1+4%&/%.3!+:F16+74&A1+&G+'1>15&431#$+.)$*>*$*17+S51)$(%17VQ+7&)*.5+1>1#$7+.#'+.+7$%&#/+.5(3#*+#1$H&%A+$F.$+&GG1%7+7(44&%$!+C.%$*)*4.#$7+G15$+.+71#71+&G+?15&#/*#/+$&+.#+15*$1+)(5$(%1+HF1%1+$F1*%+7A*557+.%1+'17*%1'+.#'+7&(/F$+.G$1%d+:F*7Q+&G+)&(%71Q+*34.)$7+$F1*%+)F.#)1+G&%+(4H.%'+3&?*5*$6!+:F1*%+.5(3#*+#1$H&%A7+.%1+41%)1*>1'+.7+.+>.5(1+%17&(%)1+*G+&#1+7F&(5'+)F&&71+$&+51.>1+G&%+.+41%*&'+&G+$*31+.#'+$F1#+H.#$+$&+%1c1#$1%d++

W$F1%+4(?5*)+71%>.#$7+1K4%1771'+.+'17*%1+G&%+*#cF&(71+a5(#)F+.#'+51.%#b+4%&/%.37+$&+.*'+*#+'1>15&4*#/+.#'+7$%1#/$F1#*#/+1345&611M3.#./131#$+%15.$*&#7F*47+.#'+)&33(#*).$*&#Q+3()F+.5&#/+$F1+7.31+5*#17+.7+HF.$+*7+&GG1%1'+?6+$F1+-2C+4%&/%.3!+:F1+C(?5*)+J1%>*)1+)&(5'+*#$%&'()1+$F1+*'1.+&G+a)&.)F*#/b^.#+*#G&%3.5+4%&)177+HF1%1+3.#./1%7+F.>1+5(#)F+H*$F+1345&6117+&#)1+.+3&#$F+$&+1K45&%1+.#'+)(5$*>.$1+*#cF&(71+$.51#$+$&+%145.)1+)&#7(5$.#$7+$F.$+.%1+)(%%1#$56+F*%1'+*#!++

\F*51+7(44&%$*#/+?*5*#/(.5*73Q+*$+H.7+7(//17$1'+$F.$+$F*7+4%&/%.3+*7+.57&+P5.H1'Q+*341'*#/+1GG1)$*>1#177+.#'+F.>1+51'+$&+71%*&(7+'*77.$*7G.)$*&#+.3&#/+7&31+71#*&%+4(?5*)+71%>.#$7!+:F1%1+*7+.+71%*&(7+)&7$+*#+3&%.51+HF1#+5.#/(./1+$%.*#*#/+*7+%1O(*%1'+&G+%17*7$.#$+51.%#1%7!+J()F+41&451+.%1+(#5*A156+$&+?1)&31+$%(56+?*5*#/(.5+.#'+&?5*/*#/+$F13+$&+a$*31+71%>1b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

:F1+Tn+61.%+&5'+G1'1%.5+)5.77*P*).$*&#+767$13+F.7+?1)&31+&($'.$1'!+2K1)($*>1+H&%A+*7+1K1)($*>1+H&%A^%171.%)F+*7+%171.%)F!+8(%%1#$56Q+$&+4.6+.+7)*1#$*7$+H&%A*#/+*#+.+

/&>1%# 3 1#$+ %171.%)F+5.?+F*7MF1%+ H&%$F+ 1O(*>.51#$+ $&+ 4%*>.$1+ 71)$&%+)& 3 41#7.$*&#+
%.$17Q+$F*7+1 3 45&611+ 3 (7$+?1+)5.77*P*1'+.7+.#+1K1)($*>1Q+.#'+.%1+1K41)$1'+$&+G(5P*55+$F1+
%&51+&G+.#+1K1)($*>1+*#+$F1+?(%1.()%.)6+*#7$1.'+&G+741#'*#/+$* 3 1+*#+$F1+5.?!+ Y.A*#/+.+
7)*1#$*7$+.#+1K1)($*>1+*7+#&#71#7*).5!++

\ F*51+ 1#)&(%./*#/+ 3 &?*5*$6+ G&%+ $F&71+ HF&+ '17*%1+ *$Q+ '14($6+ 3 *#7$1%7+ #11'+$&+ 7$.6+
4($m+ :F1+ 3 &?*5*$6+&G+.77*7$.#$+ '14($6+ 3 *#*7$1%7+H.7+'17)%*?1'+.7+a.+ 3 1%%6c/&c%&(#'+

$F1+ 3.#./1%7!+ "$+ .441.%7+ .7+ $F&(/F+ $F1%1+ .#+ .$$13 4$+ .$+ 7$.#'.%'*k*#/+ 1>1%6&#1Q+ HF*)F+ *7+ '*7*#)1#$*>1+ G&%+ .+ A11#+ 1345&611!+ :F*7+ (#'1%3*#17+)&#P*'1#)1+ .#'+ $F1+ 41%)14$*&#+&G+&41##177+*#+$F1+767$13!+

:F1+*77(1+&G+$F1+%&51+&G+(#*&#7+.#'+F&H+$F16+.GG1)$+$F1+41%G&%3.#)1+.#'+1K41%*1#)1+ &G+4(?5*)+71%>.#$7+H.7+.57&+'*7)(771'!+2345&6117+.%1+.?51+$&+%1G(71+$&+'&+)1%$.*#+

Improvements to Accountability Design

#11'7+$&+?1+1K45&%1'+G(%$F1%d+ :F1+)&3 31#$7+.#'+7(//17$*&#7+G%&3 +$F1+%&(#'$.?517+
%.*71'+ 1K)1551#$+ 4&*#$7+ $F.$+ H1%1+)&#7*'1%1'+ *#+ $F1+ %1)&3 31#'.$*&#7+ 3.'1+ *#+
a85&7*#/+$F1+"3451 3 1#$.$*&#+ i .4!b+

Participants:

J..O*?+-F3.'++

h1##*G1%+8.%$1%++

C.(5+@(GG6++

e.%.+Z*$k/1%.5'+<(71A++

e.(%15+i.7)F&++

8F&(5/1%1+Si(%(V+i(%(4%.7.'++

O*)A+h&F.5++

C1$1%+Y.)e1&'++

q*)+C.A.5#*7+

h.)O(15*#1+J3*$Fc-#/5*#+

\!+i1%%6+O&?*#7&#+

O&#+\.$$7

J65>*.+-'.3)*A+

J1.#+8&#H.6++

*#$1%+Z1'6A++

8!2!J!+Z%.#A7+

Y(%%.6+i5&H++

Y.%)+i(%7$1*#++

Y*A1+h&6)1+

Y.%$*#+Y1'1*%&7++

d&?+C.#.#*A&5.&(+

55.3+O*)F.%'+

Y15*77.+:F&37&#+

i1%.5'+d($$7

h(5*.+@.#&7

i51#'.+Z*7A

-5*7&#+Z%.71%

-#'6+i%.F.3

C1$1%+<.%%*7&#

@&#.5'+e13.*%1

-%$F(%+Y*5#17

e.%.+C1$1%7

JF.%&#+J($F1%5.#'+

<(/F+:F&%?(%#+